

21/02/2025, 11:14 pm

Re: 🇪🇬 Who Really Speaks for Palestine?

From Tony Greenstein <tonygreenstein104@gmail.com>

To UPPER HAND ORGANIZATION<info@upper-hand.org>

Date Friday, 21 February 2025 at 2:51 PM

Yes brilliant idea you morons. What better way to play into the hands of the Zionists and their supporters by portraying the Palestinian struggle as a religious one.

And what of Palestinian Christians, atheists and others. Go crawl back in your corner.

You understand nothing about the history of Zionism which is why your fucking Jihadists in Syria are in Israel's pocket. Islam has never been any solution to any problem.

Re: 🇵🇸 Who Really Speaks for Palestine?

From Tony Greenstein <tonygreenstein104@gmail.com>
 To UPPER HAND ORGANIZATION<info@upper-hand.org>
 Date Saturday, 22 February 2025 at 5:29 AM

Dear Upper Hand Organization,

As it typical of religious nuts - be they Jewish, Muslim or Christian, you rely on assertion and blind faith, not reason.

No the struggle of the Palestinians is not just a property dispute it is an anti-colonial struggle. Such concepts are alien to those who have no class or material understanding of course, hence why you understand nothing about Zionism.

Palestine is a land of the 3 religions above. There is no reason why one should dominate. The Palestinian struggle is indeed a secular one. Of course like the Zionists you see it as a religious struggle and that is why you are the mirror image of the Zionists.

You talk about the justice that Islam grants to non-Muslims. What like the Bahai in Iran? Islamic states like Iran and Saudi Arabia are vicious and repressive autocracies, corrupt to their core but using Islam to legitimise their repression. With 1,000 being hanged every year in Iran and large numbers in Saudi Arabia. This is medieval barbarism. And that is to say nothing of ISIS and their attempted genocide of the Yazidis. I see the HTS, another Islamic group has become a warm embracer of the Israeli state.

The collective identity of the Palestinians is forged by their oppression at the hands of Zionist colonisation. Islam divides it which is why Israel always bolstered Islam as a means of defeating radical left-wing Palestinians. It was even there at the birth of Hamas which it encouraged before Hamas began to take up the struggle against Israel.

Jews didn't ally with the Catholic kings of Andalusia. Indeed they were the victims of the Inquisition and a much more tolerant Islam welcomed them in North Africa.

I accept that Jews under Muslim rule in the pre-colonial period fared much better than under the Christians in Europe but that was not religious so much as a reflection of the advance of the latter into capitalism. You posit Islam as one continuous norm which is absurd. Western imperialism played Islam like a violin.

The West's victories are a product of the strength of US imperialism and its protege, the Israeli state. It has nothing to do with a retreat from the Muslim faith. However religious Muslims are it would not protect them against F-35 jets. More to the point is why the Saudis are in alliance with the United States and Iran would like to be in alliance if it could.

I never supported Oslo as it was a neo-colonial 'solution' whereby the Palestinians did Israel's dirty work. The settlements arise from settler colonialism not secularism indeed the settlers are mainly messianic madmen.

You say the imperialists never feared the left. Not true. The United States and the CIA backed Khomeini against the left in Iran.

If Israeli soldiers shouted in 1967, "The religion of Muhammad has gone and passed," it was not because they feared Islam but because they too, just like you see the struggle in religious terms. You are merely their pathetic echo chamber seeking to sow divisions in the struggle of the Palestinians which you have never supported because, like ISIS, you saw it as an Islamic struggle. That meant ISIS ended up as Israel's silent partner.

You say that ' We will not allow you to hijack this cause, and we will not permit Palestine to be anything other than an Islamic endowment'. Jewish anti-Zionists have not hijacked the Palestinian cause. We are the living proof that not all Jews support Zionism. Something you would never understand. It is not in your gift to permit anything least of all to cause Palestine to be an Islamic endowment.

You are the greatest gift to the Zionists but fortunately your voice is marginal

Tony Greenstein

Re: 🇲🇦 Who Really Speaks for Palestine?

From Tony Greenstein <tonygreenstein104@gmail.com>

To UPPER HAND ORGANIZATION<info@upper-hand.org>

Date Sunday, 23 February 2025 at 2:03 AM

To the Upper Hand (whoever that may be)

There is nothing hypocritical in saying that opposition to colonialism is about the rape and pillage of Palestine, its settling with Jewish colonists and the ethnic cleansing of Palestinians. It is not about religion, as you and the Zionists assert. It had nothing to do with the Bible or Islam. The attack on Al Aqsa and also the Christian Churches incidentally is a product of a Messianism driven by fanatical colonialism. It is a combination of colonialism and a distorted even eschatological theology.

I notice that you have nothing to say about the fact that Muslim leaders have been bought off and become collaborators - the Saudis, Iranians, Egyptians, ISIS - all of them because religion is by its nature backward and retrogressive looking to a past golden age that never was. Why are they bought off? Because imperialism has bought them off and uses them as the protectors of western oil interests in the region. You have nothing to say about that because you understand nothing of imperialism.

It is partly because Muslim leaders have turned the struggle against Zionism into a religious struggle that the Arabs have failed to emulate people like the Vietnamese and Black South Africans who threw off the yoke of colonialism. The Arab revolution was a failure partly because of the dead end of pan-Islamicism. You have no explanations, no theory, really no idea apart from parroting slogans.

You insist on making everything into religion despite the Saudi/Jordanian protectors of the Dome of the Rock being bought off. Your Islam is merely a continuation of that collaboration which is why you hate a socialist or leftist anti-colonialism which unites all oppressed people. Religion belongs in the home not in the state because in a class society religion is used to oppress people.

23/02/2025, 1:59 pm

Yes Zionism is a western project as is colonialism. Zionism isn't secular as it had to legitimise itself with the symbols of the Jewish religion and indeed transform the Jewish religion into becoming a justification for its many crimes. Secular Zionism is now a minority in Israel but you wouldn't understand that either. I don't expect you to understand any of this because you are trapped into the mode of thought that looks backwards to the 7th century and hates modernity. However most Arabs are of this century and Islam has done nothing for them, like all religions.

Of course Jewish anti-Zionism is a trojan horse to you because it makes you think or rather exposes the fact that you don't think.